

WINSTON-SALEM TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING

Cark Campbell Transportation Center Training Room
100 W. Fifth Street, Winston-Salem, NC

MINUTES

THURSDAY; April 26, 2018

PRESENT:

Board Members

Robert Garcia, Chairman
Keith King, Vice Chairman
Regina Streed
Jack Fleer
Ruth Carter

WSTA Staff

Art Barnes, General Manager
John M. Ashford, Asst. General Manger
Verylen Crawford, Operations Director
Robin Kirby, Finance Manager
Tina Carson-Wilkins, PR & Marketing
Tikiha Alston, ADA Coordinator &
Customer Service Manger

Others

Sheldon Johnson, Sr. Financial Analyst
Claire Stone

Meeting Opened: 4:01 pm

Chairman Garcia welcomed everyone to the March 26, 2018 Board Meeting.

Resolution Approving the Minutes for the March 1, 2018 Board Meeting

A moment was given to look over the minutes by Chairman Garcia.

Dr. Jack Fleer made a move to approve the minutes followed by a motion made by Vice-Chair Keith King. The minutes were passed unanimously.

Resolution Approving the Purchase of Computer Servers

Mr. Barnes stated there was a resolution authorizing the purchase of computers at the last meeting. He also mentioned it was not necessary to approve the quotes WSTA received for servers because they were below \$100,000.00. It turned out that the lowest bid for the servers came with the operating software. This raised the price to \$119,814. WSTA is asking the Board to authorize the purchase of these servers.

Resolution Authorizing the Purchase of Computer Equipment

Mr. Barnes stated that WSTA is at a point where its computer equipment has to be replaced. This is something that has been planned for a while therefore the money is in place. This includes the local match from the City of W-S.

Mr. John Ashford shared the bids include servers, monitors, keyboards and computer mice. Mr. Barnes said there is more equipment being purchased that does not have to come before the Board. However, this purchase does require the Board's approval being it is over \$100,000.

A move to approve the resolution was made by Dr. Flear and seconded by Ms. Regina Streed. The resolution was passed.

Public Comment

Claire Stone-Ms. Stone distributed handouts that consisted of complaints against WSTA, a letter from the Mayor's Office, and CAT's meeting minutes.

Ms. Stone thanked WSTA for efforts made to report the "no shows" in greater detail.

Ms. Stone said she wanted to concentrate on her request to have public comments before voting on resolutions. She stated that she did not see a problem with the public being allowed to speak on things such as the purchase of computer equipment. She said there is still time to right this wrong.

Ms. Streed commented in some cases it would be nice to have future action items listed as information items the meeting prior to when the vote will be held. Also, she feels it would be beneficial to have public comments before the vote regarding some of the action items.

Chairman Garcia said this can be looked into; however, the packets are sent out at least a week in advance and if she has any concerns, she may reach out to Mr. Barnes for further information.

Ms. Streed stated that she is thinking of a way to streamline the public input so that it also informs the Board's opportunities for decision making. She wants to get the public's comment at a time when it is useful for decision making.

Ms. Stone clarified her comment regarding public meetings held prior to rate increase for Dr. Flear. She said WSTA held public meetings; but, not public hearings prior to voting on the rate increase. Ms. Stone went on to say that the law is an actual hearing has to be held at a formal time just before the vote. The Board Members are the decision makers and were not present at the public meetings.

Mr. Barnes requested that Ms. Stone submit in writing a statement from The Federal Transit Administration (FTA) saying WSTA is incorrectly holding public meetings/hearings.

Dr. Fler asked the Board is there any harm in having a public spokesperson speak before a vote at a Board Meeting. If there is any harm; what is it?

Chairman Garcia stated a decision would need to be made regarding the public speaking on matters that are not in the interest of the public; e.g. computer purchases and retirement plans. In order to keep the meeting format the same, public comments would need to remain the same for all meetings or come before all the action items no matter the content.

Dr. Fler said that he has not contacted the FTA to find out how public hearings should be held; but, he would be glad to do so because he is very interested in this particular point. To him the most important equation to the organization WSTA are the passengers. Without them WSTA would not exist. If there is some benefit in expressing satisfaction or dis-satisfaction with a decision about to be made, Is WSTA harming its self in any significant way? Dr. Fler said he is convinced there is some benefit in letting the public speak during the Board Meetings just before the vote; unless, someone can otherwise convince him he is wrong. Dr. Fler reiterated that he would like to know if the public meetings/hearings satisfy the FTA's guide lines. Mr. Barnes stated WSTA is either wrong or is right and he would like to know which.

Chairman Garcia recommended this topic be tabled. He and Mr. Barnes agree that any time there mention of WSTA breaking a Federal law, it is a difference in saying it and proving it. Chairman Garcia said with the Board's approval, he and Mr. Barnes will have a sidebar conversation on this issue and bring it back for discussion.

Vice-Chairman King stated that he agrees with Dr. Fler in that he sees no harm in the public giving comments prior to a vote if the vote is pertaining to the public. He stated that he understands that if it is decided to do so it will open the comments to action items including those that have no bearing on the public. He went on to say during the whole time he has served on the Board he only witness public comment when it is relating to routes or fare increase.

Ms. Streed said the mechanisms of the public meetings and hearings, information meetings, and response collecting appears to meet the criteria for the public input. She is not sure what allowing the public to come in at the last minute to speak and present will add to the process.

Vice-Chairman Kings stated that he believes even though people have the opportunity to attend various meeting, they feel better about being allowed to come before the Board to give their input. Dr. Fler thanked Chairman Garcia for adding the topic to the agenda he has for sidebar conversation; however, he thinks that at the next meeting he would probably bring a resolution.

There was more discussion around the table before the topic was closed and focus was turned to the Information Items.

Information Items

Title 3 Funding Presentation-WSTA has received this funding to provide transportation to individuals over 60 years old for many years. The Piedmont Triad Regional Council (PTRC) oversees the allocation of these funds. Mr. Barnes asked everyone to direct their attention to the chart he provided. He said that it indicates the deficit incurred going back to FY14. The transportation WSTA provides has always exceeded the allocation. The expense incurred would have happened regardless if transportation wasn't provided under Title 3 being that the individuals would have transferred over to ADA designation and received free transportation anyway due to the policy the Board instituted in 2006—anyone who qualified for Medicaid could ride for free. Therefore the expense would have been the same up until this year when a fare was instituted.

Next Mr. Barnes asked the Board to look at the 2018 expense vs. allocation and said that the allocation from 2017-2018 decreased; but the number of trips increased. The reason for the trip increase is that the individuals over 60 asked to be certified under Title 3 to avoid the fare. WSTA is losing revenue that it would have had if these individuals had not been moved to Title 3.

Mr. Barnes has already met with the County Manager and the PTRC Executives. There will be a meeting tomorrow with a planning committee to suggest an increase in WSTA's allocation, especially on the medical side because a lot of those trips are dialysis trips. Mr. Barnes will also indicate to the planning committee that the number of trips will be capped at the allocation.

There are some ideas for continuing to provide transportation for these individuals.

Trapeze Funding Source Report-The Board has been discussing the inconsistency of the source reports used to provide Trans-Aid information. There was a discrepancy in the Productivity Report and the Funding Source Report. WSTA has been working with the Trapeze software Analyst the numbers now match to .0001. The goal is to get it down to zero.

Ms. Tikiha Alston spoke about the new items that were added to the report. The Funding Source Report will calculate the number of bookings that were actually performed by a client under the various funding sources WSTA provides transportation for. Attendant will be changed to personal caregiver. The companion item will remain. The client can have one caregiver and at least one companion. Additional companions will be captured under other. A client can have multi-companions as space allows. The report will still calculate regular no shows, cancelations at the door, and late cancelations.

I-40 Mitigation Proposal- WSTA received a draft contract from the North Carolina Department of Transportation (NCDOT). WSTA provided them with a

proposal for I-40 mitigation to provide additional service of regular routes, park and ride, bus rehab, and marketing.

Operations Report-Trans-Aid's number of trips is up 2%. The Timely Service-On Time category is constantly increasing. WSTA is happy about this; it is one of the things FTA wanted addressed to see a 90% on time performance. Mr. Barnes feels confident Paratransit will reach this goal. Chargeable complaints are down.

Chairman Garcia stated that Missed Trips were up by approximately 400 year-to-date. Mr. Barnes informed this number is incorrect. Dr. Fleer asked if there was a **correct number. Mr. Barnes said that there is and he would get it for the Board.**

Fixed Route's vehicle accidents are down, as well as, preventable accidents. Complaints are down while chargeable complaints are up from 21 to 30. Chairman Garcia inquired about the drop in ridership year-to-date. Mr. Barnes said the drop was expected to happen with the reconfiguration of the routes. Mr. Barnes said he cannot speak on how long it will take for it to increase and come back up; he would simply be speculating if he did so.

Maintenance's numbers are consistent to what they normally are. There is nothing that stands out on its report. Mr. Barnes asked Mr. Ashford to explain the difference in Major Mechanical Failures and Other Mechanical Failures.

Financial Report-According to the Financial Report, WSTA is in an excellent position right now

Marketing Report-Mrs. Tina Carson-Wilkins gave a detailed Marketing Report from a handout included in the meeting Packet. Ms. Alston spoke about the Intellectual and Development Disabilities Council Meeting she attended.

For more Marketing details please refer to the report included in the meeting packet.

The meeting adjourned at 5:25 p.m.

Transcribed by: Teika Holloway

May 18, 2018