



WINSTON-SALEM TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING

Clark Campbell Transportation Center Training Room
100 W. Fifth Street, Winston-Salem, NC 27101

MINUTES

THURSDAY; July 25, 2019

PRESENT:

Board Members

Robert Garcia, Chairman
Keith King, Vice-Chairman
Jack Fleer
Willie Clark Jr.
Jeanette Lawson-Jackson

Public

Dr. Craig Richardson, Professor of
Economics at Winston Salem State
University (WSSU)
Michael Clinton, CEO of MD3 Media
Marketing, LLC
Dan McLaughlin

City Staff

Toneq´ McCullough, Director of Transportation
Brenda King, Finance Manager
Carol Patrick, DOT Planner
Heather Curry, Budget, Budget and Evaluation Analyst
Byron Brown, City Principal Planner
Dewey Willard, Accounting Services Manager

WSTA Staff

Donna Woodson, General Manager
John M. Ashford, Asst. General Manger
Robin Kirby, Finance Manager
Tina Carson-Wilkins, PR & Marketing
Tikiha Alston, ADA Coordinator &
Customer Service Manger
Verlyen, Crawford, Director of Operations
Teika Holloway, Administrative Assistant

Meeting Opened: 4:01 pm

Chairman Robert Garcia welcomed everyone to the July 25, 2019 WSTA Board Meeting. He said the agenda is full; therefore, he would get to it.

He began by stating, as many of you know, One of WSTA's Board Members passed away—Mrs. Ruth Carter. Emails went out notifying everyone of her passing. Chairman



Garcia thanked Dr. Jack Fler for attending the Memorial Service and representing WSTA. He also shared his fond memories of Mrs. Carter, noting her humor, her passion for transit, and her intellect. “She was a woman not afraid to speak her mind.”

He asked that everyone join him for a brief moment of Silence in memory of Mrs. Ruth Carter.

Dr. Fler asked to have words. He shared the thing he remembers most about Mrs. Carter is she did a wonderful job representing the people in her community. She always seemed to be in touch with the need of her community; as stated by Chairman Garcia, she was willing to tell about it. Dr. Fler said that after attending her service, she seemed to be beloved and highly respected in her community.

Safety Message

Safety Message—Ms. Donna Woodson: *Safety is as simple as ABC—Always Be Careful! If you doubt it; don’t do it!*

Public Comment

Chairman Garcia welcomed our guest speaker, Dr. Craig Richardson. The two-minute limit was lifted and Dr. Richardson took the floor.

Dr. Richardson began by thanking Ms. Woodson for inviting him to speak to the WSTA Board and introducing himself. Dr. Richardson is an economics professor at WSSU and; also, the director of The Center for the Study of Economic Mobility (CSEM). After starting a couple of years, CSEM became very interested in why Forsyth County had such a hard time getting people out of poverty. We all know that the City of Winston-Salem is not designed around public transportation; it is designed around the car. Like a lot of other southern cities, it is sprawled out. Even if a family had one car it would be difficult to maneuver getting everyone where they need to be. With that being said, CSEM began to look at public transportation; more specifically the transit bus system—not to critique it—however, to look into the lives of the passengers. The questions CSEM had were: What are their lives like; Where do they work; What are their lives like outside of work.

CSEM surveyed 215 employed WSTA passengers and released their findings in the form of a 70-page study. Dr. Richardson said he will share some of the highlights the study revealed about the lives of passengers.

Dr. Richardson went on to say he knows budgets are tight. The things WSTA hear about and would like to see done—such as more bus shelters, more routes, and etc.—are all needs. However, he said he will speak about some other innovative options and ways to plug into the existing bus system that may help with some of these existing issues.

Opportunity Costs: Time=Money. Dr. Richardson said he is an economist and economist talk a lot about opportunity costs. Opportunity costs are often referred to as

the road not taken (If I am doing this, what am I not doing? or If you were not here, where would you be?)

One of the first things CSEM considered is the bus is very cheap. It has cost \$1 per ride since 1998; but, what about the time-cost of getting to where you need to be? This is the second part of the study. In other words, how many minutes does it take. CSEM found out the average employed passenger spends approximately 134 minutes per day (over two hours) going back and forth to work. This equates to an extra 8.6 hours per week or 34 extra hours of commuting per month (per the handout distributed by Dr. Richardson near the end of his comments). One (1) in seven (7) employed bus riders work more than 45 hours a week. Most work 34 hours a week or more.

As an economist, Dr. Richardson stated, he is interested in time. We are all familiar with the phrase “Time is Money.” When all the additional time spent commuting using the transit system vs. a personal vehicle is added up, it comes out to be 408 lost hours per year. This translates to an average of more than \$4,000.00 in potential lost wages to an average salary of \$20,000.00 a year. The average employed bus rider earns about \$10.00 per hour. Dr. Richardson asked the meeting attendees to think about valuing an hour being on the bus at \$10.00 (this is a quick way of putting an amount on time). He went on to say for some individuals it is worth more.

The Road Not Taken. Nearly half of the employed riders said they have turned down a better job offer from another company because it was not on the bus route. Dr. Richardson said, when we, ourselves, think about moving up the success later, most do not think about whether or not the company is on a bus route. We would be thinking about getting there by car. Forty-four percent of the employed riders say the bus routes interfere with them getting better employment opportunities. The question now is if you had taken the job, how much would it have paid? Again, the average employed rider earns about \$10.00 per hour. The job they passed up would have paid over \$12.00 an hour; so, they turned down and over twenty percent pay raise. Thirteen percent have turned down promotions which were like getting thirty percent pay raises.

On the Edge. Dr. Richardson said bus riders’ lives are more fragile if they are on the edge. Having a lot of extra hours (approx. 9) spent commuting to work a week contributes to the fragility of their lives. Twenty percent of the riders lost their jobs when the routes changed. This is 1 person in every 5 people. In addition to losing their job, it took them an average of 84 days (almost 3 months) to find a new job. That’s something to think about. Forty-four percent said they face disciplinary measures if they are late for work—one particular person said they were docked \$1.00 per minute if they are late.

CSEM did a documentary titled *Bus Stop Jobs*; and, it can be found on *YouTube*. It is about a day in the life of a bus rider in Winston-Salem. She was followed from 6 am to 6 pm. Dr. Richardson invited anyone who had not seen the video to watch it.

He said Transloc (a Durham, NC based company that does micro-transit solutions) invited him to come and show the video. Someone in the company had seen it and was very moved by it. Transloc told Dr. Richardson it wants to help the City of Winston-



Salem and asked how they could do so. Dr. Richardson distributed his handout which included information he had just shared and information about Transloc.

Ms. Woodson shared she and Mr. Verlyen Crawford, WSTA's Operations Director, has spoken with Ms. Noelle Claybrook, Business Development Associate for Transloc, on a couple of times via conference calls.

Approval of the May 30, 2019 WSTA Board Minutes

Chairman Garcia gave the members of the Board a moment to review the minutes from the May 30, 2019 WSTA Board Meeting.

To be clear, Ms. Woodson stated there was an amendment made to the minutes from the last Board Meeting. She wanted everyone to take a moment to consider its approval with the motions being made.

Vice-chairman Keith King made a motion to approve the May 30, 2019 WSTA Board Meeting Minutes with the Amendment. His motion was followed with a second made by Mrs. Jeanette Lawson-Jackson. The May 30, 2019 WSTA Board Meeting Minutes were approved.

Resolution Authorizing a Contract with Piedmont Triad Regional Council and WSTA for Transportation Services

For the sake of saving time, Ms. Woodson did not read the proposed resolution verbatim aloud to the Board Members. The resolutions are included in the meeting packet.

The resolution is asking the Board authorize the General Manager to enter into a contract with the Piedmont Triad Regional Council (Area Agency on Aging) for the provision of transportation services during the term of the contract beginning July 1, 2019 and ending June 30, 2020. Trans-Aid has been designated for an allocation in the amount of \$257,748.00. This amount is \$10,000.00 less than last year.

Dr. Fleeer moved to authorize this contract. Mr. Willie Clark Jr. made the second move. The Board Authorized, unanimously, a Contract with Piedmont Triad Regional Council and WSTA for Transportation Services.

Resolution to Approve a One-Year Extension with North State Security

In 2018 Winston-Salem Transit Authority entered into the original contract North State Security for 1 year with (3) 1-year optional extensions. WSTA's request is that the Board will approve the first, optional 1-year extension with North State Security Group.

The expenses for the first, optional 1-year extension is not to exceed \$165,000.00 (there is no change in fee). The contract's first, 1-year extension will begin July 1, 2019 and end June 30, 2020.

Dr. Fleeer made a motion to approve the Resolution Authorizing a Contract Extension for Security Services. His move was followed by Mr. Clark Jr. The resolution was passed unanimously by the WSTA Board.



Resolution to Authorizing a Contract with Forsyth County for the Provision of Medicaid Transportation

Forsyth County, on behalf of the Department of Social Services would like to contract with the Winston-Salem Transit Authority for the provision of Medicaid related transportation services and tickets. The term of the contract would begin July 1, 2019 and end June 30, 2020.

Chairman Garcia noted the resolution did not include costs or charges. Ms. Woodson stated there is no charge other than the purchase of tickets as needed.

Dr. Flear stated on the Consolidated Statement for Period 7, \$100,000.00 is listed for Medicaid. He asked if this category statement of account money tied to this contract. Chairman Garcia said he believed this category is the reimbursement from Medicaid. Ms. Woodson confirmed this to be true. The contract is only to provide the service not to be reimbursed. Chairman Garcia added the reimbursement amount fluctuates depending on the usage.

Mrs. Lawson-Jackson moved to approve the resolution Authorizing a Contract with Forsyth County for the Provision of Medicaid Transportation. Vice-Chairman King made a second move. The resolution was approved.

Resolution Approving the Submittal of the Bus and Bus Facility Grant Application

The Transit Administration announced funding opportunities for the “Bus and Bus Facilities Program.” It has been recommended that WSTA apply for funding in the amount of \$1,500,000.00 with a required local match for as much as \$300,000. The Winston-Salem DOT and WSTA are asking for the Board’s approval to apply for this funding.

Chairman Garcia asked what the spending restrictions are. Ms. Woodson said the funds can be used the purchase buses and upgrades to the bus facilities. As far upgrades are concerned, WSTA is looking at installing touch-and-go pads to change fare structure. Another upgrade, regarding the ticket machines, was approved at the last Board Meeting. Upgrades to the building facilities are being taken in consideration as well.

Dr. Flear moved to approve the resolution. His move made simultaneously by Vice-Chairman King and Mrs. Lawson-Jackson. The Resolution Approving the Submittal of the Bus and Bus Facility Grant Application was approved.

Old Business:

Rock Out the Quarry Update. This event took place on June 29th. WSTA’s participation in the event was to provide bus service for the local residents as well as any citizens coming into the city to attend the “Rock Out the Quarry” event. Although Ms. Woodson was unable to attend the event, she was told WSTA did an excellent job providing this service. There were 8 buses transporting people to and from

the Quarry and over 3,000 people were transported out of the 6,000 people in attendance. There were only 2 issues with the 3,000 people transported.

New Business:

Recommendations for additional Board Members. Ms. Woodson was contacted by the Mayor's Office in regards to the Board's need for additional members. The Mayor's Office asked Ms. Woodson to address the Board by asking if anyone had any recommendations of individuals that may be interested in being a part of the WSTA Board. The Board Members were instructed to send the recommendations to Ms. Woodson and she will ensure they get to the Mayor's Office.

REMIX Planning Software. Ms. Woodson stated, in addition to the comments she made to Dr. Richardson regarding she and Mr. Crawford communicating with Transloc about micro transit opportunities, there is a need for planning software. The cost is less than \$100,000.00 and WSTA has gotten approval to contract with Remix. The software is designed to input census data and transit information and it will give all the demographics including costs, travel time transit route options etc. When the time comes to make changes to or modify routes this software will allow WSTA and planning to input data for the original routes and the return demographics will assist with getting bus service to places of interest that could possibly offer job opportunities, and things of that nature.

There should be a kick-off meeting and the software will possibly go live sometime near the end of August. Ms. Woodson said that she would keep the Board updated. Ms. Woodson said the software is already being used by PART and they have had great success in using it. GTA recently acquired a contract with Remix; as do, Raleigh and Charlotte. Therefore, it is well versed. Ms. Woodson stated she has some literature on the software and would gladly email it to anyone interested in seeing it.

Ms. Woodson said she attended a conference earlier this summer, Remix did a presentation. There were a lot of people in attendance and some of their clients that happened to be there gave testimonials on behalf of Remix. Ms. Woodson said she believes Remix is a good tool and that WSDOT and WSTA will have lots of success with their planning efforts utilizing it.

Chairman Garcia stated this is a third-party entity and asked if the City of Winston-Salem is already using them. Ms. Woodson replied no. She said Ms. Carol Patrick, City Planner, will be spearheading this effort and when the kick-off meeting is held, data will be given to Remix from WSDOT, as well as, WSTA to be entered into the software. Being that the software is cloud based, WSTA will have access to PART's Data, High Point and possibly GTA's data as well as others in the region (will have the capability to see each other's data).

Chairman Garcia asked Ms. Woodson if she felt confident about the software and inquired about the cost. Ms. Woodson confirmed her confidence in the software and stated it costs \$21,000.00 a year.

Medicaid Transformation: Managed Care Handout. This handout was included in the meeting packet. Ms. Woodson said she added it to the agenda so the Board could read it and be informed about what is going on with Medicaid in the state of North Carolina. Managed Care is already in use and several states and is now in NC. It is a program that is believed to manage housing, medical, transportation, and other aspects of an individual's life. Recipients of this type of Medicaid will go through a provider. There are 5 different providers the recipients will be divided and assigned to. The providers will book the individuals medical transportation. This means the providers would have to have a contract with WSTA in order for WSTA to provide transportation for any clients they have.

Managed Care is scheduled to go live in November 2019. They are in the beginning stages of securing contracts. WSTA's Medicaid pool that falls under this category of Medicaid is a little over 4 percent—a small population of our clients that fall under this Medicaid option.

WSTA Website Update. Ms. Tina Carson-Wilkins introduced her guest presenter—Mr. Michael Clinton of MD3 Media Marketing. Mrs. Carson-Wilkins shared a member of the Transit Riders Advisory Committee contacted Ms. Tikiha Alston and her in regards to locating something on the WSTA website. It took them approximately 5 clicks to get to the information being sought. This motivated her to seek to make the website more user friendly. Mrs. Carson-Wilkins, Mr. Clinton, Ms. Woodson, Ms. Alston, and City Councilman Dan Besse all gave input to making the website more efficient, streamlined, and easier to navigate.

Mr. Clinton presented the Board with a PowerPoint presentation demonstrating the changes and updates that were made. The website is still in development mode; but is scheduled to go live in the next few days. Mr. Clinton gave the web address to the beta site to meeting attendees so that they could explore the new website if desired.

Everyone in attendance appeared to be impressed and approving of Mr. Clinton's demonstration of the updated site.

FY18/19 Annual Operational Report-Power Point Slide. Ms. Carol Patrick introduced herself to some and re-introduced herself to others. She is the newest City of Winston-Salem Planner. She will work closely with WSTA on transit planning endeavors. She said she is excited to be giving her first presentation.

Overall, ridership performance was up 12.7 percent for TransAid and 5.7 percent for Fixed Route. The fastest growing route is Route 100, It's ridership increased 73.3 percent. Route 99 endured a 9.3 percent decrease in ridership. The northwest region of the City had the greatest percent of ridership. This region consists of Routes 87,88,89,90,91,97,99,106, and 108. On-Time performance was up 1.2 percent for Fixed Route and down 7.9 percent for TransAid. Revenue Miles were up 17.6 percent for Fixed Route and 2.8 percent for TransAid. Cost per passenger was down for both Fixed Route and TransAid—5 percent for Fixed Route and 17 percent for TransAid. Accidents and Injuries were way up. There was an over 100 percent increase in fixed Route and a 39 percent increase for TransAid. The number of Wheelchair passengers

increased 1.7 percent for Fixed Route and 2.6 percent for TransAid. Fixed Route bicycle passengers were up 17.8 percent. Telephone performance (Hold-Time) was down 2.4 percent. Maintenance work related hours were down 5.6 percent while Mechanic work hours were up 10.9 percent. Maintenance inspection hours were down 2.5 percent

Ms. Patrick opened the floor to questions. Both Chairman Garcia and Dr. Flear said the presentation was very helpful. Dr. Flear told Ms. Patrick it was desirable for her to share her slides for a study. Both Ms. Woodson and Ms. Patrick agreed to do so. Ms. Woodson told Dr. Flear she would make certain he gets a copy.

Information Items: (No Board Action Needed):

- ***Fixed Route and Trans-Aid Operations Reports: May 2019 and June 2019-***

Reports were included in the Meeting Packet. Discussion of the reports was tabled due to time restraints. Any questions or concerns regarding the reports are to be directed to Ms. Woodson.

- ***Maintenance Report: May 2019 and June 2019-***

Reports were included in the Meeting Packet. Discussion of the reports was tabled due to time restraints. Any questions or concerns regarding the reports are to be directed to Ms. Woodson.

- ***Finance Report Update: May 2019 and June 2019-***

Reports were included in the Meeting Packet. Discussion of the reports was tabled due to time restraints. Any questions or concerns regarding the reports are to be directed to Ms. Woodson.

- ***Marketing Report: May 2019 and June 2019-***

Reports were included in the Meeting Packet. Discussion of the reports was tabled due to time restraints. Any questions or concerns regarding the reports are to be directed to Ms. Woodson.

Although there was no discussion regarding the Marketing Report, Mrs. Carson-Wilkins did share a video containing highlights of the Annual Accessible Festival that was held July 12, 2019. As usual, the festival was a huge success. The feeling of Hawaii was in the air as WSTA staff transformed the Winston-Salem Fairground's Education Building into a Hawaiian Luau—ALOHA!!!! |

Before closing, Ms. Woodson distributed the information requested by Dr. Flear regarding the cost of National Black Theatre Festival. She was only able to go back to the previous year (2017) of the NBTF. In the past the bus transportation was ran and provided solely by WSTA; therefore, there were no substantial costs involved. This year buses had to be contracted.

The meeting adjourned at 5:26 p.m.

Transcribed by: Teika Holloway

August, 2019