



WINSTON-SALEM TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING

Cark Campbell Transportation Center Training Room
100 W. Fifth Street, Winston-Salem, NC 27101

MINUTES

THURSDAY; May 30, 2019

PRESENT:

Board Members

Robert Garcia, Chairman
Keith King, Vice-Chairman
Jack Fleer
Willie Clark Jr.
Jeanette Lawson-Jackson

WSTA Staff

Donna Woodson, General Manager
John M. Ashford, Asst. General Manger
Robin Kirby, Finance Manager
Tina Carson-Wilkins, PR & Marketing
Tikiha Alston, ADA Coordinator &
Customer Service Manger
Jackie Ijames Settle. Mobility Management

Additional Staff

Toneq´ McCullough, City of Winston-Salem-DOT, Transportation Director
Brenda King, City of Winston-Salem-DOT, Finance Manager
Carol Patrick, City of Winston-Salem-DOT, City Planner

Meeting Opened: 4:03 pm

Chairman Robert Garcia welcomed everyone to the May 30, 2019 WSTA Board Meeting.

Safety Message

Before giving the safety message, Ms. Donna Woodson thanked everyone for coming out and participating in the Board Meeting.

Safety Message—Donna Woodson: *Safety is a Full-Time Job! Don't, make it a Part-Time Practice! (Erica Lowery, WSTA Staff Member-shared May 23, 2019)*

Public Comment (2-minute limit)

No Public Comments



Approval of the March 28, 2019 WSTA Board Minutes

Chairman Garcia gave the members of the Board a moment to review the minutes from the March 28, 2019 WSTA Board Meeting.

Dr. Jack Fler recommended edits be made to the minutes. He recommended that the minutes include the specifics of what is being done to reduce vehicle accidents and the frequency. In addition, the WSTA Safety Action Plan 2019 document that was distributed at a previous meeting needs to be in the minutes. He also noted typos that needed to be corrected.

The corrections were made to the minutes and the sent out via email to the Board and meeting participants along with the FY 20 Proposed WSTA Budget Breakdown and WSTA's Safety Action Plan.

Dr. Jack Fler made a motion to approve the March 28, 2019 WSTA Board Meeting Minutes with the edits he proposed. His motion was followed with a second made by Vice-Chairman Keith King. The March 28, 2019 WSTA Board Meeting Minutes were approved.

Resolution to Approve Ticket Vending Machine Purchase and Upgrades

WSTA presented this resolution to the Board to ask approval for the purchase of a new ticket vending machine and to make upgrades to the current machines. The additional machine and upgrades will allow purchasers the option to use a credit or debit card.

The new machine will be located at Union Station. The current machines will be upgraded to allow credit and debit card transactions.

Dr. Fler moved to approve the purchase of a new ticket machine and the upgrades to the current ticket machines. Mrs. Jeanette Lawson-Jackson second. The Board approved, unanimously, the purchase of a new ticket vending machine and upgrades to the current ticket machines.

Resolution to Approve Sole Source Vendors

WSTA asked the Board to approve Sole Source Vendors. Prior to presenting this resolution to the Board, WSTA received approval from the City of Winston-Salem's Purchasing Department. This approval is being requested to award purchase orders with equipment vendors for equipment, parts, repairs, and maintenance of equipment used by WSTA's operations which is only available through the authorized dealer/distributor or by the manufactured of the equipment. N.C.G.S 143-129(e) provides that formal bid procedures "shall not apply to purchases of apparatus, supplies, materials, or equipment when performance or price competition for the products are not available; when a needed product is available from only one source of supply.

Exhibit A (included in the meeting packet with this resolution) is a list of equipment vendors that have been identified as the only authorized distributor or manufacturer of the equipment. It is the recommendation of the Purchasing Director and General Manager that purchase orders for equipment vendors supplying parts, making repairs, and performing maintenance of equipment used in WSTA operations for the period of July 1, 2019-June 30, 2020, be awarded to each vendor based on historical spending data as identified on Exhibit A. Exhibit A is pictured below.

EXHIBIT A			
VENDOR	CITY/STATE	PRODUCT/SERVICE	ESTIMATED ANNUAL SPEND
CUMMINS ATLANTIC, LLC	GREENSBORO, NC	ENGINE PARTS	150,000
GILLIG LLC	HAYWARD, CA	BUS/ENGINE PARTS	100,000
NEW FLYER	WINNIPEG MANITOBA CANADA	BUS/ENGINE PARTS	100,000
CREATIVE BUS	CHARLOTTE, NC	BUS/ENGINE PARTS	50,000
PREVOST CAR INC	ELGIN, IL	BUS/ENGINE PARTS	50,000
MOHAWK MFG AND SUPPLY CO	NILES, IL	BUS/ENGINE PARTS	50,000
MUNCIE TRANSIT SUPPLY	MUNCIE, IN	BUS/ENGINE PARTS	50,000
DIESEL EQUIPMENT COMPANY	GREENSBORO, NC	BUS/ENGINE PARTS	20,000
GFI GENFARE	ATLANTA, GA	FAIRBOX PARTS	20,000
	Total Estimated spend		590,000

Dr. Fleer made a motion to approve the resolution awarding purchase orders for sole source vendors. Vice-Chairman King second for this approval. The resolution awarding purchase orders for sole source vendors was passed.

Resolution to Approve Contractor for Black Theatre Festival Shuttle Service

Historically, WSTA has been able to provide transportation for the Black Theatre Festival. Due to the increase in service and the additional mitigation routes, WSTA does not have adequate drivers and/or buses to meet the demand festival this year. Therefore, the City of Winston-Salem issued a Request for Proposal (RFP) requesting bidders to submit a proposal to provide bus shuttle service from July 28, 2019 through August 3, 2019 for the event. Proposals were received from: Black Tie Bus Charters, Sunway Charters, First Student, and Ben’s Tours.



The proposals were scored on price, qualifications, experience, MWBE, and the location of the business. The maximum points to possibly be awarded was 500. From the four proposals submitted, Sunway Charters was awarded the highest amount of points.

WSTA will operate all available WSTA buses; the remaining buses needed will be contracted to Sunway Charters. The total cost for the contracted services of Sunway Charters must not exceed \$300,000. At the present time, it is unknown how many chartered buses will be needed. The event list was very recently received from the festival committee and operations is currently working on the schedules. The schedules based off the events will determine how many buses will be needed.

This resolution is being presented to the Board at this time—with the understanding that whatever the need is, it will not exceed \$300,000—due to timing. Once the need is identified, there may or may not be a Board meeting in time enough to go through the process of resolution approval.

Dr. Fleer asked if WSTA has a cost estimate for this service from previous years. This information was not readily available at the time of the meeting. Ms. Toneq' McCullough advised the information will be provided at a later time. Dr. Fleer shared his concerns about the cost involved with providing this service. He stated it is a very good cause and he has certainly enjoyed the festival himself; however, during its longevity there has been a number of other good causes in the community—one of which is the Medical Connector—that wasn't provided due to cost restraints. Dr. Fleer advised on that the Medical Connector was presented and discussed with the Board some time last year; but he is not sure what it would have cost. He is very interested in seeing what it cost to provide transportation for the festival. Dr. Fleer asked if this service was going to continue or is this just for this year. Ms. Donna Woodson replied stating the festival is held biennial; however, this resolution is only for the current year. Within the next 2 years, there may be a surplus of buses available and chartered buses may not be needed. Dr. Fleer said he suppose he asked the question knowing what the answer would be; he wonders what type of precedent is being set.

Ms. McCullough spoke historically on the City of Winston-Salem's involvement in the festival and how all parties involved derived to this point. She said that the City is a huge sponsor of the National Black Theatre Festival. Different departments at the City contribute their services, and, WSTA is one of the departments that contribute their services. In the past WSTA buses were used, but as indicated by WSTA's General Manager, this time all WSTA buses are not available for use. This is the reason the City is looking outside the department to outsource. While this resolution is for this year only, in two years there will probably be other ways WSTA will be able to contribute and provide this service.

Dr. Fleer said that there is another factor that he considers when he thinks about this service being provided is the people that come from out of town to attend the event are well-to-do people. He said that when he mentions they are well-to-do, he doesn't mean

they are millionaires or billionaires; he means they have paid money to come to the city and attend the productions. Dr. Fler stated one of his concerns (he will bring up later when he feels it is appropriate) is the entire issue of providing a transportation system that serves the interest of low-income people better.

Dr. Fler moved the resolution be approved. Mrs. Lawson-Jackson made the second move to approve the resolution. The resolution approving contractor selection for special shuttle service for 2019 Black Theatre Festival was approved.

Old Business:

WSTA's First Fare Free Day! Ms. Donna Woodson informed the Board of WSTA's first time participating in annual 'fare free' day which was held on April 25, 2019. The entire Triad participated; this was HiTran and WSTA's first year participating.

WSTA staff rode buses with the passengers and they were very appreciative of 'fare free' day. Although it was heavily advertised, some passengers say they weren't aware of it and were trying to pay. The fare boxes were covered and the passengers gladly place their monies back into their pockets. There was a slight increase in ridership and WSTA is looking forward to participating in this event in the coming years.

New Business:

WSTA's Website Update. It was mentioned at a previous meeting that our web designer, Mr. Michael Clinton, is revising WSTA's website to make it more user friendly. It will be sort of a one-stop-shop meaning you will be able to go to one page and access any information you want. Ms. Woodson reported he is doing a really good job. Unfortunately, he was not available to attend today's Board Meeting. Once he has completed the website, the Board will be given the link to access and tour it.

Introduction of a New Transit Planner. The City has hired a new Transit Planner filling one of the two positions open. The particular person will predominantly be assisting WSTA with planning operations. With that being said, Ms. Woodson introduced Ms. Carol Patrick to the Members of the Board.

Ms. Patrick, greeted the Board and shared a little about herself. She stated she is looking forward to working with WSTA, being a Transportation Planner, and helping with improving the services in the City.

Information Items: (No Board Action Needed):

- I. ***Fixed Route and Trans-Aid Operations Reports: March and April 2019-***
Chairman Garcia asked Ms. Woodson and the members of the Board if there was anything in the report they wanted to highlight. Ms. Woodson stated that the

meetings are sometimes held every other month and she wants the Board to be presented with the monthly information. This is the reason for the reports for two months; there is no gaps in information the Board receives.

- II. Chairman Garcia gave compliments on Fixed Route's complaints being down. On that note, Ms. Woodson mentioned that operators are sometimes brought into the office for coaching, counselling, or corrective discipline. However, there are occasions where passengers call in or write in to compliment the operators. With that being said, WSTA started issuing certificates for such occasions. They are being given out as a part of the Safety meetings. The certificates are presented with a hand shake and "Thank you" to let the operator know they are appreciated.

Chairman Garcia complimented Fixed Route on the chargeable complaints being down year-to-date even though the actual complaints are up. Ms. Woodson explained that the passengers get upset for one reason or another and call in and make a complaint. Once the complaint is investigated and it is determined that it is to no fault of WSTA or the Operator it is deemed to be non-chargeable; these offsets the complaints.

Chairman Garcia asked about giving the drivers incentives. Ms. Woodson said that this is forthcoming; from past experience when you give incentives up front it causes an increase in compliments which makes it a little questionable. Not to insinuate anything; but there needs to some way to ensure the compliments are valid. She shared a story of how giving incentives went the wrong way for a transit system she used to work for. Ms. Woodson stated that WSTA plans to have some incentives put in place in the future with safe guards.

Chairman Garcia mentioned there is a considerable drop Trans-Aid's year-to-date missed trips even though they are up by 20 for the month of April.

Dr. Fler inquired if WSTA did not have access to the Timely Services-On time % due to the N/A status in the year-to-date columns. Ms. Donna stated the information can be retrieved and reported. She also stated the Timely Services-On time % has been added to the Fixed Route reports.

Maintenance Report March and April 2019-Chairman Garcia asked Mr. John Ashford to explain the Major Mechanical System Failures category on the Maintenance report. Mr. John said these are buses that could not be repaired and returned to service the same day. Chairman Garcia felt this was high considering the buses are hybrid. Mr. Ashford explained they went to a new way of capturing this information. He gave an example of a bus needing a part such as a light bulb that was not in stock, the bus would be placed out of service until the part was received. Even though this is minor it would still be categorized as Major Mechanical Failure because it was not returned to service that same day. Chairman Garcia then inquired about Revenue Vehicles. Mr. Ashford explained this is the number of

vehicles serviced by Maintenance such as Fixed Route, Trans-Aid and Part vehicles used to generate revenue.

- III. **Finance Report Update**-Mrs. Robin Kirby went over the Finance reports (included in the meeting packet) with the Board. She noted revenues for both Fixed Route and Trans-Aid are up slightly for period 10's allocation. Although there are a couple of revenues below budget for both, there are some that are well of above projection. The bottom line indicates that the revenues for Fixed Route are at 87% and Trans-Aid are at 86% as of April.

Mrs. Yeymy Jones stated the Property Tax Transfer will be different from what is showing on the report due to the way she was capturing it. She also said it will be corrected in a couple of days.

Chairman Garcia mentioned the revenues exceeded the expenses for Trans-Aid as well. Ms. Woodson said this is mostly due to salaries and benefits; this is the reason for the overages in both departments—Fixed Route and Trans-Aid.

Dr. Fleeer he was trying to figure out how the revenues for the bus transportation system are allocated and he could not come to a satisfactory conclusion. His question is how are revenues allocated for the bus transportation system allocated in terms of revenue brought in by fares, advertising, or whatever it may be and revenue that is essentially inter-governmental transfers—either the City provides the money to WSTA, the county provides the money to WSTA, or the Federal government provides the money to WSTA. He would like to see the big figure of what WSTA's revenues are and the breakdown of how they are allocated in terms of sources. Dr. Fleeer said this is something he should know being he has served on the Board for 6 years; but he doesn't. In terms of expenditures he would like to know what the actual expenditure are. He is trying to get an indication of how much the system is subsidized.

WSTA and the City of Winston-Salem vowed to get this information for Dr. Fleeer.

- IV. **Marketing Report-March and April 2019**-The Marketing Report was included in the meeting packet. It highlighted the *Get on Board Public Transit Day Initiative, Earth Day Fair, Community Events, The Annual Barrier Awareness Day Activities*. Ms. Tina Carson-Wilkins gave a list of WSTA's upcoming Events.

The meeting adjourned at 5:10 p.m.

Transcribed by: Teika Holloway
June, 2019